Assessing HIPs Well
Moving Toward an Institutional Assessment Plan

Thomas F. Nelson Laird
Our Four Questions

• How (effectively) are HIPs currently being assessed at your institution?
• What challenges do we face in doing HIP assessment well?
• What can be done to improve HIP assessment processes?
• How can the assessment of different HIPs be stitched together into an institution-wide assessment plan?
Why Assess HIPs?
High-Impact Practices

- First-Year Seminars & Experiences
- Common Intellectual Experiences
- Learning Communities
- Collaborative Assignments & Projects
- Writing Intensive Courses
- Undergraduate Research
- Diversity & Global Learning
- Service/Community-Based Learning
- Internships
- Capstone Courses & Projects
- ePortfolios
High-Impact Practice

Extended period + Time

Result in...

Outcomes

Notably greater engagement

High levels of learning
5 Reasons to Assess HIPs

But why is it high-impact?
What Should be Assessed about a HIP?
Focus Assessment On

• Participation/participants (and non-participants)
  • How many, who, and why
  • Disaggregate!

• Participant experience and environment
  • Key elements of the HIP process (things that lead to impact)
  • Disaggregate!

• Impact
  • Goal achievement, unexpected learning
  • Differential impact!
Interesting & Incomplete HIP Findings
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HIP</th>
<th>FYS Min</th>
<th>FYS Max</th>
<th>FYS Mean</th>
<th>SR Min</th>
<th>SR Max</th>
<th>SR Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Service-learning</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>99%</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culminating Experience</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>97%</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study abroad</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate research</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning community</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internship</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least one HIP</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>97%</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two or more HIPs</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Student HIP Participation Differences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Less likely</strong></th>
<th><strong>Mixed results</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Online</td>
<td>Service learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• First Generation</td>
<td>Internships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Transfer</td>
<td>Study abroad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Younger</td>
<td>Service learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Internships</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>More likely</strong></th>
<th><strong>Mixed results</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Female</td>
<td>Service learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Frat/sorority</td>
<td>Study abroad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Fulltime</td>
<td>Internships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Higher grades</td>
<td>Service learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Internhips</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- International students
- Athletes
- STEM majors
- Asian Americans
- African Americans
- Latinx/Hispanic Americans
HIP Participation by Average Faculty Importance

- FY Learning Comm
- SR Study abroad
- SR UG Research
- SR Culminating senior exp

Somewhat important | Important | Very important

0% | 10% | 20% | 30% | 40% | 50% | 60%

2 | 3 | 4

Somewhat important | Important | Very important
HIPs and Outcomes

• In general, HIP participation linked to greater
  • Student engagement in effective educational practices
  • Satisfaction
  • Self-reported learning

• Specific outcomes for specific HIPs in specific contexts
Exercise 1

• How (effectively) are HIPs currently being assessed at your institutions?
• Share answers to the following with a neighbor...
  • How are participation, experience/environment and impact assessed for a HIP at your institution?
  • How well do you think this assessment is done?
  • How are the results shared?
  • How does the assessment foster HIP improvement?
Exercise 2

• What challenges do we face in doing HIP assessment well?

• Task—With your neighbor, discuss the following
  • What are the key challenges to assessing HIPs?
  • What is needed to avoid, work through, or get around these challenges?
Got an Assessment Model?
Assessment and the Culture of Evidence

Planning & Budgeting

Assessable Outcomes

Instrumentation

Implementation

Application of Findings

Tracking Data Collection Analysis

Assessment & Evaluation

Improvement

Culture of Evidence

Adapted from Banta et al. (2007)
Continuum of Assessment Planning

- Nothing much
- Bits and pieces
- Cobbled parts
- Coordinated
- Part of the fabric
Assessment Methods
Common Methods + Examples

• What are the common methods used to assess HIPs?

• What are the common informal methods used to assess HIPs?
Exercise 3

• What can be done to improve HIP assessment processes?

• Questions for everyone
  • Who controls HIP assessment at your institution?
  • How would you learn about all the HIP assessment being done at your institution?
  • What information is really (not) needed?
  • How is the assessment of one HIP connected to the assessment of others?
Might an Assessment Plan Help?
Plan Components

• **Mission, goals, outcomes**
  • Striving for alignment and differentiation
• **Map(s) of educational process(es)**
• **Assessment/evaluation methods**
• **Implementation plan**
• **Reporting plan (audience and format)**
• **Dissemination plan**
Exercise 4a

• With a neighbor...
  • Pick a HIP
  • Write 1 or 2 goals for that HIP
  • Write 1-3 specific, measurable outcomes for each goal
Map Example 1.1: Simple HIP Map
Map Example 1.2: Study Abroad Map

Input

- Pre-departure Experiences
- Courses abroad
- Co-curric abroad
- Reflective exercise while abroad
- Transition home

Outcome
Map Example 2: Guided Learning Pathways

- **FIRST-YEAR INQUIRY and COLLEGE WRITING**

- **CREATIVE & ARTISTIC INQUIRY**

- **CROSS-CULTURAL and GLOBAL STUDIES**

- **CULTURAL/HISTORICAL INTERPRETATION**

- **SCIENCE EXPLORATIONS**

- **SOCIO-ECONOMIC ANALYSIS**

- **SECOND-YEAR INQUIRY SEMINAR**
  - Cross-disciplinary questions and student signature project

- **THEMATIC COURSE CLUSTERS**
  - Three or more courses across multiple disciplines, including the major field. A student examines questions important to him/her and to society.

  - **THEMATIC COURSE 1**
  - **THEMATIC COURSE 2**
  - **THEMATIC COURSE 3**

- **SIGNATURE WORK**
  - A student's best work, which can take many forms (e.g., capstone; internship; field work; research; community-based research)

---

**E-PORTFOLIO SHOWS STUDENTS PROBLEM-BASED LEARNING AND PROFICIENCIES OVER TIME**

- Diversity and global learning courses
- High-Impact Practices (HIpps)
- Courses related to major field

- Writing intensive
- Intensive in quantitative analysis
- Both writing intensive and intensive in quantitative analysis

---

For students in two-year degree programs, this work is Signature Work. For students in four-year degree programs, it is Preparation for Signature Work. Transfer students may take the second-year inquiry seminar at the original institution or following transfer.
Exercise 4b

• With your neighbor, create an ed exp map for your HIP
  • What are the key components or experiences?
  • In what order do they occur?
  • What’s optional and what’s required?
  • What key work do participants do?
  • What artifacts are produced?

• What information do you need to collect about your HIP?
Future Exercise (4c)

• Building from 4a & b
  • What specific method(s) will be used?
  • Which instruments will be used?
  • When will information be gathered?
  • How will the information be analyzed?

• Create succinct summaries of your answers
Future Exercise (4d)

• How can the assessment of different HIPs be stitched together into an institution-wide assessment plan?
• Repeat exercises 4a-c with your team for your work here (add step 4d = pulling things together into a plan)
• Reflect
  • Could you do this exercise on your campus?
  • Who would need to be there?
  • How might it be helpful?
Final Thoughts & Questions
Thank you!