Defining, Evaluating, and Rewarding Faculty Mentorship of Undergraduate Research

Iain Crawford1, Jeffrey Osborn2, Aimee Knupsky3, John Barthell4, and Anne Boettcher5

1University of Delaware, 2The College of New Jersey, Allegheny College, 3University of Central Oklahoma, 4Embry-Riddle Aeronautical University


Why?

URSCA firmly established as high-impact best practice: LEAP 2005
CUR membership as indicator of growth: doubled since 2011
Yet, incorporation of URSCA into faculty workload and evaluation often remains incomplete

Session Goals

1. Describe experiences from four different kinds of institution at different stages in the process of developing methodologies and from four different perspectives
2. Engage audience in reflection on where their institutions are and how to move forward in the process
3. Share best ideas

Where are you?

1. Have well-developed systems and are interested in sharing?
2. Have not begun to address this question or are in the early stages?
3. Somewhere in the middle and running into questions?

The Future of Learning

In the contemporary world, research is a survival skill.

As a skill, research demands that you find a path where there is no road map; it is both an analytical process and a process of discovery. It requires rigor, tenacity, originality, and confidence.


The College of Jersey

Transforming an Institutional Culture
Integrating Undergraduate Research, Scholarship, and Creative Activity into the Fabric of The College of New Jersey

Jeffrey M. Osborn
Dean, School of Science

TCNJ THE COLLEGE OF NEW JERSEY
Structural & Cultural Changes
• Began by defining the learning environment we desired.
• Framed our conversations around the respective roles of students and faculty members needed to achieve our desired learning environment.
• Defined guiding principles.
• Defined and revised our curricula (liberal learning and departmental).
• Shifted to a teacher-scholar faculty model and culture.
• Shifted from a traditional “teaching load” system to a holistic “workload” system.
• Revisions to our T&P documents and processes to recognize and reward what is important and align these with our values.

Overview and Summary
• “Transformed” the entire College curriculum, providing students with more rigor, more flexibility, and credit for high-impact, engaged learning experiences.
• Basic course “foot print” did not change.
• Focused on learning outcomes, not seat time.
• Comprehensive effort with an ambitious timeline.
• Transformed general education, first-year experience, and all majors curricula in 18 months.
• Shifted from a credit hour-based system to a course unit-based system – each course unit effectively became a 4-credit hour course.

Overview and Summary
• Shifted from a traditional teaching load system to a comprehensive and holistic faculty work load system.
• Provided in-load credit for:
  ◦ Engaging students outside of the “classroom” in high-impact learning experiences, including URSCA.
  ◦ Mentoring and advising.
  ◦ Scholarship.
  ◦ Course design/curriculum development.
• Re-conceptualized the 4:4 teaching load – shifted to a 3:3 course load.

“Load” Comparison
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pre-Transformation</th>
<th>Comprehensive “Faculty Workload” System</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Teaching Load</td>
<td>24 FWH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scholarship</td>
<td>3 FWH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advising/Mentoring</td>
<td>3 FWH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Workload</td>
<td>24 FWH</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Transforming Faculty Work

Recognizing and Rewarding the Faculty Role
TCNJ has adopted a teacher-scholar culture, where URSCA is integrated in our faculty workload model and in our Tenure & Promotion documents/policies.
• Mentoring/teaching component – Transparent and equitable system for recognizing student mentoring in classroom-based pedagogies and in traditionally ‘outside of load’ high-impact pedagogies (e.g., research, internship, practicum, studio, etc.) within our workload model.
• Scholarship component – Scholarship is included in ‘load’ in our workload model and our department/program-based “Disciplinary Standards for Scholarship” include language about student engagement and outcomes in T&P documents.

Allegheny College
URSCA as “heart” of Allegheny experience….
• Senior project for 70 years for all students
• Scaffolded curriculum to prepare students for URSCA—FS101, FS102, FS201, junior seminar, senior project
• Independent studies encouraged in 1st and 2nd year
• Vibrant research community in summer
Faculty RCSA Travel Grants

Faculty On-Campus Grants
Faculty RCSA Travel Grants
URCAT

UOC Faculty Handbook revised to allow faculty mentoring students with on-campus (RCSA) grants to be paid a stipend or to bank hours toward a course reassignment.

Resources for Faculty & Students

CURE-STEM

Written agreement among the Dean, Department Chair, and the Scholar
Renewable and are written for 4 years for new tenure-track faculty and 3 years for existing tenured faculty members
Annually develop (or revise) and submit a grant proposal to the agreed upon agency.

CRITERIA FOR TENURE EVALUATION. Each college must determine written, quantifiable, objective measures consistent with the mission of the college and university, to apply in the tenure process. The criteria of each college shall reflect the engagement of students in transformation learning, to include, as appropriate, areas such as discipline knowledge, leadership, research, scholarly, and creative activities; service learning and civic engagement activities; global and cultural competencies; and health and wellness.

Table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2007-2008</td>
<td>509 faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008-2009</td>
<td>1,000 faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009-2010</td>
<td>1,500 faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010-2011</td>
<td>2,000 faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011-2012</td>
<td>2,500 faculty</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Discipline Knowledge
• Leadership
• Research, Creative and Scholarly Activities
• Service Learning and Civic Engagement
• Global and Cultural Competencies
• Health and Wellness

Excerpted revision to teaching language....

“Allegheny College supports the use of all teaching practices that enhance student engagement, intellectual growth, and persistence at Allegheny. These practices can take place in a variety of contexts: in classrooms; in laboratories; in the field; in clinical settings; through service learning and community-based learning; team-teaching; clustered courses; learning communities; collaborative learning; diversity and global learning; internships; and through the mentoring of students, including through student research.”

Excerpted revision to scholarship language....

“While all faculty are expected to undertake professional activities that produce scholarly results such as publications or other finite outcomes, creative and scholarly practices may also produce other sorts of results that are also valued professionally at Allegheny. The candidate undertaking such work should demonstrate how this work, in its results and by its processes, constitutes a valuable accomplishment and how it contributes to the advancement of her or his field(s).”

Key Lessons and Take-aways...

- Know your institutional culture—faculty commitment? governance process? URSCA culture? likely objections?
- Take initiative—provide example language, be persistent, follow-up with governance structures.
- Maintain core principles, but be willing to compromise on the peripheral details (e.g., HIP terminology)
- Let the faculty talk—conversations at local level (e.g., departments, committees) as well as institutional level

Timeline, final language, resources
## TL Scholars & OHIP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transformative Learning Scholar Support Package</th>
<th>Cost Per Scholar</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faculty Reassignment Time</td>
<td>$5,490</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(6 hours per academic year; adjunct replacement)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages for Undergraduate Researcher(s)</td>
<td>$2,420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support for faculty member and student to travel to a professional meeting where the student is presenting</td>
<td>$3,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel for grant development/professional conference</td>
<td>$1,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Support</strong></td>
<td><strong>$12,410</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Created Fall 2014 to liaise with offices and departments promoting high-impact practices (Centre for Global Competency, Volunteer Service Learning Center, etc.)

Promotes undergraduate research and the RCSA program

Promotes participation in NCUR and in securing the 2018 bid

Website with resources for faculty and students

## Model in Development

**Mission:** The University’s Western residential campus is Embry-Riddle’s center for academic excellence, student/faculty research, and student involvement in the learning process. Our curricula are centered on practical, hands-on learning, individual mentoring by experienced and committed faculty/staff, and executed in state-of-the-art facilities. The campus graduates global leaders in aviation, engineering, business, public service, safety, global security and intelligence and the applied sciences.

Undergraduate Research SACSCOC Quality Enhancement Plan (2012-2017)

## Model in Development

- Creation of the Undergraduate Research Institute
- Strong mentorship
- Uneven participation across programs
- Lack of formal and consistent recognition in workload and tenure and promotion

## Model in Development

**Workload Committee:** Faculty, Deans, UR (2016-2017)

### Recommended Models

**Teaching Emphasis:** 4:3 course load
- Teaching 40%
- Scholarship 30%
- Service 30%

**Teaching-Research/Scholarship Emphasis:** 3:3 course load
- Teaching 60%
- Scholarship 30%
- Service 10%

**Teaching-Industry Outreach Balance:** 3:3 course load
- Teaching 50%
- Industry Outreach 30%
- Service 20%

**Research/Scholarship Emphasis:** 3:3 course load
- Teaching 30%
- Scholarship 30%
- Service 40%

**Research/Scholarship Emphasis:** Chair (Dean variable course load)
- Teaching 25%
- Administrative Leadership 25%
- Scholarship 50%

### Additional Recommendations/Concerns

1. Need more standardized and minable faculty activity reporting mechanism
2. Need to assure even evaluation and valuation of different workload models
3. Need to revise Faculty Handbook to accurately reflect new mode for workload with corresponding changes in Tenure and Promotion criteria
4. Cost

### Progress

1. Colleges establishing discipline-specific scholarship standards
2. University committee established to review and standardize the language and process for T&P across our three campuses
3. University (re)considering platform for faculty activity reports and T&P

## Model in Development

**Workload Committee:** Faculty, Deans, UR (2016-2017)

### Additional Recommendations/Concerns

1. Need more standardized and minable faculty activity reporting mechanism
2. Need to assure even evaluation and valuation of different workload models
3. Need to revise Faculty Handbook to accurately reflect new mode for workload with corresponding changes in Tenure and Promotion criteria
4. Cost

### Progress

1. Colleges establishing discipline-specific scholarship standards
2. University committee established to review and standardize the language and process for T&P across our three campuses
3. University (re)considering platform for faculty activity reports and T&P

## Think-Pair-Share

1. What is the role of URSCA in your institutional mission and vision?
2. Is it included in faculty workload and is that reflected in T&P policies?
3. Is their consistency across the diversity of disciplines?
4. How can you move it forward and how can CUR help?

If your institution has adopted policies/procedures/"best practices" with regards to the role of URSCA in workload and tenure & promotion, please share with CUR Workload Taskforce Chair, Janet Morrison: morrisja@tcnj.edu
**Defining, Evaluating, and Rewarding Faculty Mentorship of Undergraduate Research**
**AAC&U 2019 - Raising Our Voices: Reclaiming the Narrative on the Value of Higher Education**
**Atlanta, GA – 23-26 January 2019**

*In this interactive session, panelists from a range of institutional types will briefly describe processes for integration of URSCA into faculty workload, evaluation, and recognition/reward systems on their various campuses, which are at varied stages in their own development of such processes.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Panelist</th>
<th>Institution Profile</th>
<th>URSCA: Workload and Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Iain Crawford: Associate Professor of English and Faculty Director of Undergraduate Research Program, University of Delaware, Newark, DE. President of CUR. (<a href="mailto:icrawf@udel.edu">icrawf@udel.edu</a>)</td>
<td>Doctoral University; Very High Research Activity. 19,000 undergraduates; 4,000 graduate students; 800 professional and continuing studies students</td>
<td>600 students involved in funded summer research annually; 100 students complete university Senior Thesis annually; recent gen ed reform implemented capstone requirement for all majors. No formal recognition of URSCA mentoring in faculty appraisal and workload documents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeffrey Osborn: Dean of the School of Science, The College of New Jersey, Ewing, NJ. Past President of CUR, CUR Fellow. (<a href="mailto:josborn@tcnj.edu">josborn@tcnj.edu</a>)</td>
<td>Public Master’s College, but primarily undergraduate institution; enrollment of ~7,400 students, including 6,790 undergraduates and 610 masters students.</td>
<td>TCNJ has adopted a holistic teacher-scholar model, where URSCA is integrated and valuedboth in our faculty workload and in our Tenure &amp; Promotion documents/policies. Our workload model includes a transparent and equitable system for recognizing student mentoring in classroom-based pedagogies and in traditionally ‘outside of load’ high-impact pedagogies. Scholarship is included ‘in-load’ in our workload modelandour College-wide T&amp;P document and our departmental “Disciplinary Standards for Scholarship” include language about student engagement and outcomes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aimee Knupsky: Director of Undergraduate Research, Scholarship, and Creative Activities and Associate Professor of Psychology, Allegheny College, Meadville, PA. Councilor CUR. (<a href="mailto:aknupsky@allegheny.edu">aknupsky@allegheny.edu</a>)</td>
<td>Private, national liberal arts college; enrollment ~2000 undergraduates</td>
<td>Faculty supervising required, senior research project receive points toward course release (3 points for first reader; 1 point for second reader; 44 points for course release). Faculty who supervise URSCA through independent study during the academic year or summer research receive no compensation. New T&amp;P guidelines that explicitly recognize URSCA are in place. Faculty in the humanities have explored new ways of presenting this work for review.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Barthell: Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs, University of Central Oklahoma, Edmond, OK. Councilor CUR. (<a href="mailto:jbarthell@uco.edu">jbarthell@uco.edu</a>)</td>
<td>Public Master’s College and Predominately Undergraduate Institution (PUI) with an enrollment of ~15,400 students; Oklahoma’s Metropolitan University</td>
<td>Tenure and promotion documents, as well as the Faculty Handbook, have been updated to reflect an expectation of faculty engagement in high-impact practices such as URSCA, as well as to address workload issues by creating avenues for providing reassignment time via a banking system. Support for faculty engaged in URSCA (reassignment time, supplies, travel support, and student wages) is available through programs such as CURE-STEM, the Transformative Learning Scholars program, the Office of High Impact Practices, and the Office of Research and Sponsored Programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anne Boettcher: Director, Undergraduate Research Institute &amp; Honors Program, Embry-Riddle Aeronautical University, Prescott, AZ. Immediate Past President CUR. (<a href="mailto:boettcha@erau.edu">boettcha@erau.edu</a>)</td>
<td>Private, aviation and aerospace specialization; enrollment (Prescott Campus) ~2600 undergraduates, ~50 graduate students</td>
<td>University and campus level examination of URSCA in workload, discussion regarding improved methods for gathering data on participation, consideration of role in tenure and promotion with changes in the faculty handbook.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. What is the role of URSCA in your institutional mission and vision?

2. Is it included in faculty workload and is that reflected in T&P policies?

3. Is their consistency across the diversity of disciplines?

4. How can you move it forward and how can CUR help?

If your institution has adopted policies/procedures/“best practices” with regards to the role of URSCA in workload and tenure & promotion, please share with CUR Workload Taskforce Chair, Janet Morrison: morrisja@tcnj.edu